This most recent, and comprehensive compendium, on the subject of the architecture of Islam sheds light on the subject materials. New information on well-known historical examples, the inclusion of historical examples not usually (if ever covered) in such scholarship and an expansion of analysis with respect to modern and contemporary case studies of Islamic religious spaces all underscore the scholarly contribution of this two-volume set. By including such a range of buildings examined, by
a large number of scholars from various backgrounds, the compendium effectively recasts the direction of scholarship in this field in a manner that is neither linear or hierarchical.

This two-volume set includes 58 essays on a range of regionally-specific examples of architecture from the Islamic world. The first volume of *The Religious Architecture of Islam* focusses on Asia and Australia, and the second volume focusses on *Africa, Europe and the Americas*. The volumes are organized in a non-chronological manner, with essays grouped by geographical region covering materials directly related the understanding of religious architecture of Islam.

In Volume I, there are four sections with a total of 32 essays written by 29 different scholars. The four sections are: Background themes, West and Central Asia, South and East Asia and Australia.

In Volume II, there are four sections with a total of 26 essays written by 20 different scholars. The four sections are: Al-Andalus and the Maghrib, Africa and Sicily, Europe and the Americas.

**Volume I**

In the **first section**, Background Themes the five essays (about 10 pages each with images) effectively set the tone for both volumes of the compendium.

‘Locating the Sacred in Early Islamic Architecture’ by Heba Mostafa, examines the sacred role of nature and contextual setting in Islam’s earliest dedicated spaces and the types of architecture created for faith including the most sacred sites (in Mecca, Jerusalem and Medina), places of prayers such as mosques and commemorative funerary structures.

‘The Mosque in the Urban Context’ by Nezar AlSayyad and Ipek Türeli, outlines the history and development of mosque architecture including examples of the early conversions of spaces in various regions. The essay continues with an examination of the location of mosques in the urban contexts, both as cities grew and as insertions into dense urban fabrics. Modern place-making of mosques is examined as state-funded projects in Muslim-majority countries and as hallmarks of identity in the diaspora.
‘Gardens as Places of Piety and Faith’ by D. Fairchild Ruggles surveys the portrayal and expression of gardens in the Qur’an, literature and in design. Ruggles specifies that confluence of meanings between ‘paradise’ and ‘garden’ by some is a result of the same Arabic word used for both, ‘jannat’, thus context is imperative. The essay includes a succinct historical outline of the design and development of gardens in the Islamic world and some examples in mosques and tomb areas. Ruggles also outlines the manifestation of the garden ideal in material arts associated with mosques such as prayer rugs, wall mosaics, mihrab surface elaboration.

‘Complex Patterns and Three-Dimensional Geometry in Islamic Religious architecture’ by Imdat As reviews the history and origins of geometric design, dating back to the 10th C, which paralleled developments in mathematics and geometry. As surveys the range of geometric motifs and physical expressions in various architectural materials both as 2D surface elaboration and in 3D expression such as muqarnas, in vaulting and column capital with specific historical examples. As surveys contemporary analytical literature on the subject and positions the questions regarding the potential roles of geometry in contemporary design in and for the Islamic world.

‘Archives and Archival Documents in the Study of Islamic Religious Architecture by Matthew Saba and Michael A. Toler examines the types of materials in historical, colonial, national, NGOs and contemporary archives with contents ranging from patronage texts (especially waqf deeds), legal documents written on various materials to images and other visual media. The chapter surveys materials and contents in major archival collections across the world related to Islamic religious architecture and digital archival collections such as Archnet.org and the Aga Khan Documentation Center in the MIT Libraries.

The second section ‘West and Central Asia’ includes 19 essays. ‘The Holy Mosque of Mecca’ by Abeer Hussam Eddin Allahham opens this section with an examination of the history, significance, elements (architectural and ritual) and reconstruction of the Holy Kaaba and the Meccan precinct, including contemporary expansions.

The second essay in this section, ‘The Mosque of the Prophet at Medina’ by Akel Ismail Kahera succinctly reviews the historical
development and expansions of the mosque as well as the major contemporary changes. Kahera has covered some of this in previous scholarship and in this chapter focusses on the additions to the architecture and surrounding area of the Mosque of the Prophet at Medina. The paradigmatic importance of the mosque frames the conclusion.

Following the two most important spaces of worship in Islam, the third essay in this section, ‘The Dome of the Rock through the Centuries’ by Kathryn Blair Moore, surveys the historical significance of the site, the original historical construction and subsequent modifications concluding with 20th century architecture documentation and relevance to contemporary scholarship.

Mattia Guidetti has written the fourth and fifth essays, respectively ‘The Great Mosque of Damascus through the Medieval Period’ and ‘Early Islam and Byzantine Churches’. Guidetti, in ‘The Great Mosque’ summarizes the historical foundation and developments of this mosque space including the decorative program (with extensive mosaics reviewed), concluding with a discussion of the social and religious importance of the mosque. In ‘Early Islam’ Guidetti continues his scholarship with a study of the architecture in the Byzantine territories conquered by Muslim armies in the seventh century. Several case studies are assessed, revealing the relationship between sacred spaces of both faiths at this time in Aleppo, Damascus, Hama, Jerusalem and Bethlehem. Guidetti argues that a coexistence of competing sacred spaces established a type of dialogue between the communities that was impactful in both visual cultures.

‘Early Mosques in Iran and Central Asia’ by Melanie Michailidis identifies the causal links from several pre-Islamic traditions (including Zoroastrian, Sassanian, Nestorian Christianity) to the eventual development of the seminally important four-iwan hypostyle structure of the 12th century great mosque of Isfahan. Michailidis analyzes examples of converted pre-Islamic worship spaces into mosques, the use of temporal materials such as unbaked brick amongst other factors to underscore the eventual, later, adoption of the ‘hypostyle Arabic mosque’ type. The chapter profiles this broad argument supported with specific examples and an analysis of existing literature on the subject.
Funerary Architecture in Iraq under the Abbasids and their Successors, 750-1250’ by Matthew Saba traces the development of tomb and mausoleum construction under the Abbasids by (and for) both Shi’ite and Sunni groups, from ‘simple domed cubes’ to the regionally innovative exposed muqarnas domes that have a near tower-like appearance. Saba underscores the patronage of the prolific number of funerary structures by members of the ruling elite include Caliphs’ building programs that initiated construction, modified existing structures or intentionally destroyed them.

‘Muslims, Byzantines and Western Christians on the Haram al-Sharif’ by Megan Boomer and Robert Ousterhout summarizes existing scholarship on the various Abrahamic layers of construction in the most venerated area of Jerusalem. Understood contextually, the various Judaic, Christian and Muslim holy places that were constructed and modified have such intertwined histories and contemporary experiential qualities which necessitate an understanding of the whole.

‘Mosques under the Ayyubids’ by Stephanie Mulder succinctly summarizes scholarship on the subject and outlines variations in forms and materials of various extant Ayyubid mosques and the madrasas and mausolea used at the time for various purposes. In addition to the various forms, Mulder notes the influence of patronage and the role of these spaces within their urban contexts.

‘Shrines in the Central Islamic Lands’ is an excellent summary of this building type also by Stephanie Mulder. Specific historical examples are included from Iraq and the Levant. Mulder outlines scholarship on the subject and the range of programming and usage associated with these sites. As many of the historical sites examined are in active continued use, the restoration and renovations represent the ‘living form of architecture’.

‘Shrines and Mausolea in Iran and Central Asia’ by Melanie Michailidis examines early funerary architecture, the mausolea of the Samanid period and the tomb towers of the Ziyarids and the Bavandids.

‘The Ilkhanids and their Successors’ by Sheila Blair includes an succinct survey of historical structures constructed during this period identifying key patterns and external influences on design with a focus on funerary complexes.
‘Religious Architecture of Central Asia under the Timurids and their Successors’ by Bernard O’Kane focusses on key historical structures of this era. O’Kane, author of several books on the subject, provides a detailed examination of architectural form and surface elaboration through the lens of contextual development.

‘Religious Architecture of Safavid Iran’ by Farshid Emami examines the saints and shrines, the mosque and Sufi sanctuary and the imperial Friday Mosque. This chapter in particular includes a range of architectural drawings, and includes a study of the experiential qualities through ritual and use.

‘Islamic Architecture in Medieval Anatolia, 1150-1450’ by Oya Pancaroğlu surveys the mosques, tombs, and complexes with multiple functions of this era with a range of well-known and lesser-known examples.

‘Three Sufi Shrines under the Ottomans’ by Zeynep Yürekli focusses on the shrine of Ibn ‘Arabi in Damascus, the Shrine of Rumi in Konya, and the Shrine of Haji Bektaş Hacibektas near Kirşehir. Through this specific analysis, Yürekli reviewed influences beyond the immediate context in a multi-disciplinary fashion.

‘Seljuk and Ottoman Mosques’ by Ali Uzay Peker examines mosques in pre-Ottoman Anatolia, the early Ottoman period after the conquest of Constantinople, the mosques of the famed, and prolific, architect Mimar Sinan and late Ottoman mosques. The chapter includes an ample number of drawings, comparatively analyzed chronologically and in terms of formal development.

‘Kocatepe: The Unbuilt State Mosque of Turkey’ by İmdat As reviews the winning design for the design competition for the Kocatepe State Mosque in Anakara held in 1957, organized by the Foundation of Religious Affairs. The rationalist-modernist design by Vedat Dalokay reinterpreted typical elements of historical Ottoman Mosque architecture but was abandoned in early stages of construction and in 1967 a new competition was held with a winning neo-classical Ottoman mosque constructed instead. The original design by Dalokay was implemented in the Gulf States, Saudi Arabia and in Pakistan (King Faisal Mosque). The chapter, with detailed drawings, outlines Dalakoy’s original design, and images from a digitally modeled version by As.
‘Regionalist Expressions of the Mosque in the Arabian Peninsula and Middle East’ by James Steele examines the works of several prominent architects reinterpreting historical idioms in modern and contemporary mosque designs in the region. The chapter includes a review of Hassan Fathy’s mosques and Abdel Wahid El-Wakil’s expansion of Fathy’s principles, and Rasem Badran’s alternative reading of Fathy. The chapter concludes with a brief review of Mohammed Saleh Makiya’s work in Iraq and the Gulf region.

The third section of the first volume, ‘South and East Asia’ includes seven essays. ‘The Sultanates in South Asia, 700-1690’ by Alka Patel reviews nearly a millennia of sacred spaces designed for/under Islamic rule in the region. The chapter is divided into two parts, with a summary of early Islam in south Asia (700-1150 CE) followed by an examination of the Sultanates (1190-1690). Throughout the chapter specific examples, with photographs, are analyzed.

‘Mughal Religious Architecture’ by Laura E. Parodi focusses on the works of the Indian Timurids, also known as the Mughals who ruled between 1494-1858 CE. With a consideration of specific examples, the chapter is divided into two sections: congregational mosques and funerary complexes. Parodi argues that the architecture of this period continued practices in design prior to their rule and included references to Timurid approaches.

The following two chapters are both written by Kamil Khan Mumtaz. In ‘Badshahi Masjid, Lahore’ this specific mosque is examined in detail. Constructed by Aurangzeb in 1674 the chapter examines the Badshahi Masjid in comparison to other major mosques constructed in Fathepur Sikri by Akbar (1571) and in Delhi by Shah Jahan (1644-58). Comparative architectural drawings and photographs are utilized throughout the chapter. In ‘The Architecture of Sufi Shrines in Pakistan’, Mumtaz considers examples with ample historical text materials and images to analyze both the development of the architectural forms dating from the 14th century, but also the experiential qualities in the various buildings which have been in continued use for centuries.

The last three chapters of this section cover material not normally included in compendiums on architecture of the Islamic world and certainly serves to address some gaps in scholarship on the subject.
‘Pre-Islamic and Vernacular Elements in the Southeast Asian Mosques of Nusantara’ by Imran bin Tajudeen is a comprehensive summary of factors influencing and developed qualities of mosque architecture in the Nusantara region which includes present-day Indonesia, Malaysia, Brunei as well as some areas of Singapore, Philippines, Thailand and Vietnam. Beginning with the region’s earliest extant mosque, the chapter aptly outlines pre-Islamic influences in the region and summaries vernacular types of mosques, various roof structures that have specific local meanings, structural methods and ornamentation with several case studies. Tomb architecture and ancillary spaces are also discussed. The chapter wraps up with regional examples of mosque design in the eighteenth and subsequent centuries leading to ‘indo-saracenic’, modernist and neo-vernacular mosques.

‘The Mosque in China’ by Nancy S. Steinhardt outlines the long history of architecture for Islam in China, dating back 1400 years and covers the influence of other religious architecture in the region. Steinhardt notes that there are more than 39,000 mosques in China today, 70 of which have extant historical architecture or inscriptions. The chapter synopsizes the history of China’s first Muslims and the earliest worship spaces with a focus on two early mosques. The chapter outlines mosques designed under Mongol rule in China, the most prominent mosques in various regions of the country and concludes with notes on contemporary Chinese mosque design.

‘The Great Mosque of Xi’an (Qing Zhen Si) by Hasan-Uddin Khan focuses specifically on this historically notable and large mosque in China constructed in 1392 CE. The chapter includes architectural drawings and photographs and an analysis of the historical development of the large complex and focuses on architectural elements including structure and ornamentation. Khan traces the addition of structures, repair and modifications since the construction to present day.

The final section of the book ‘Australia’ includes one essay ‘New Australian Mosques’ by Tammy Gaber which begins with a brief history of the presence of Muslims in Australia dating back three centuries. The earliest mosques are analyzed, including visual documentation and a survey of notable mosques constructed in the major cities are
evaluated with respect to programming, orientation and gender allocations. The focus of the chapter are two new mosques, the Newport Mosque in Melbourne designed by Glenn Murcutt and Hakan Elevi and the Punchbowl mosque in Sydney designed by Angelo Candalepas. The chapter with reflections on the power of new image making in the diaspora by Muslims.

Most of the sections covering historical examples refer to established scholarship on the subject, with a range of descriptive summaries of specific buildings to identifying patterns in particular regions. Throughout the volume there are ample colour photographs, however, only a few chapters include architectural drawings.

**Volume II**

This volume could easily stand alone for the quantity of original content, however the structure presumes its pairing with the previous volume as it does not include its own introduction and launches immediately into the impressive content divided into four sections: Al-Andalus and the Maghrib; Africa and Sicily; Europe; and the Americas. The sections are further divided, and in total include 22 chapters.

The **first section** of this volume, Al-Andulas and the Maghrib’ (historic Arabic terms for Iberia and North Africa respectively) includes seven essays. The first two chapters are written by Glaire D. Anderson, in ‘Early Mosque Architecture in Al-Andalus and the Maghrib’, Anderson outlines the establishment of nascent Muslim communities in these regions. The chapter focusses on the architecture constructed in the subsequent centuries with an emphasis on specific congregational mosques and neighbourhood mosques from present-day Spain, Tunisia and Morocco. In the following chapter, ‘Islamic Religious Spaces in Secular Monuments in the West Through the Caliphal Period’, Anderson studies the religious spaces built within royal cities and palaces (termed as ‘secular monuments’) between the 9-11th century in Iberia and North Africa. Attention is paid to examples in present-day Tunisia, Spain and Algeria with an examination of extant ruins and historical materials.
‘The Mosque of Cordoba’ by Susan Calvo Capilla is a focussed study of a monumental mosque in Spain originally constructed in 785-6 CE and expanded several times in the subsequent centuries. This chapter reviews the historical sources, pre-existing structures, excavations, and traces the historical development of mosque in its various expansions, wrapping up with an account of the final expansion in 987-8 CE.

‘The Mosque of Cordoba and Iberia’s Christians’ by Jan Carlos Ruiz Souza continues the story of the mosque discussed in the previous chapter with a study of the influences and role of the Mosque of Cordoba on the subsequent construction of worship spaces by Iberia’s Christian population. The chapter includes examples of several churches that demonstrate these influences in the structure, detailing and design elements.

‘Almohad Religious Spaces’ by Jessica Renee Streit traces the history of the Almohad Empire (1130-1269 CE) and surveys religious spaces constructed during the early Almohad movement, as well as the typology and characteristics of Almohad mosques. This chapter focusses on examples in Seville, Spain and from Tinmal, Marrakesh, and Rabat in Morocco.

‘The Taifa-period Mosques of Al-Andalus’ by Susana Calvo Capilla surveys the mosques constructed during the Taifa period in the eleventh century in al-Andalus with a focus on mosques from Toledo, Almeria, Zaragoza, Seville, Granada and the Palatine Oratories. Many of the examples are of smaller mosques overlooked in general surveys and the chapter outlines the causal connections in their designs.

The last chapter in this section, ‘The Rural and Urban Mosques of Al-Andalus’, by Susan Calvo Capilla, effectively follows with a study of rural and urban mosques in al-Andalus focussing on the examples in Cordoba, Toledo, Lorca, Huelva, Seville in present-day Spain and in Mertola in present-day Portugal.

The second section of this volume, ‘Africa and Sicily’ includes 11 essays. ‘Fatimid Mosques’ by Jonathan M. Bloom comprehensively outlines the geographical extent and impact of the Fatimids who reigned from 909-117 CE and surveys mosques and religious monuments in Tunisia and Egypt. Bloom has written significantly on the subject and his analysis in this chapter includes a study of general features, ornament and epigraphy.
‘Religious Spaces in Islamic and Norman Sicily’ by Kristen Streahle studies the extant architecture and textual materials of these spaces. The chapter begins with a review of the Aghlabid conquest of Sicily during the 9th century CE and historical sources describing this and the nature of the settlement tracing influences on the architecture from throughout the region. With a focus on the Aghlabid capital of Palermo and the independent emirate of Bari on the mainland established in the same era. The chapter then outlines the rule of Sicily under the Kalbid dynasty late in the 9th, early tenth century and the influence of the Fatimids. The extant physical remains of the Islamic spaces constructed during this time are minimal, as many Islamic structures were either destroyed by or subsumed within Christian monuments. Examples in the chapter focuses on remnants of these buildings. The Islamic cemeteries in Palermo and the Jewish quarter are reviewed in additional to smaller mosques in Sicily, within and outside of Palermo.

‘The Ribats of North Africa’ by Lara Tohme briefly notes the historical fortress structures termed as ‘ribat’ in various cities in North Africa. Two examples are illustrated within the three page chapter, in present-day Tunisia.

‘The Almoravid Religious Spaces of Marrakesh and Fez’ by Mariam Rosser-Owen utilizes ample historical textual materials and extant architecture to outline a history of this period in these two Moroccan cities with a focus on mosque architecture. The chapter is impressively filled with architectural and detail drawings and photographs.

‘The Great Mosque of Tlemcen’ by Cynthia Robinson is a focussed study of the 11th-12th century Al-Andalusian Mosque. With architectural drawings and ample photographs the author summarizes historical records and extant evidence of the spatial qualities and modifications of the building.

‘The Mosque of Hassan II, Casablanca’ by Hasan-Uddin Khan is a focussed analysis of the 1950’s Moroccan mosque and the historical precedents utilized to guide the design of the surface elaboration. The chapter includes architectural drawings and photographs to further underscore the analysis of the mosque and its qualities serving as an expression of identity.
In the following two chapters, Amira K. Bennison examines the social role of two types of structures in the Maghrib: religious schools madrasas and mosques. In ‘Madrasas in the Maghrib’ Bennison studies several religious school structures in Morocco and a few from Tunisia. In addition to the architectural qualities and historical research, the author outlines the social role and impact of these religious schools. In ‘Mosques and Society in the Maghrib’ Bennison similarly analyses examples in Tunisia, Algeria, Morocco and Al Andalus.

‘Mamluk Religious Architecture’ by Stephennie Mulder is the only chapter with an analysis of religious spaces for Islam in Egypt, a surprising decision given the construction of mosques in the country for over a millennium. This chapter focuses on the three centuries of Mamluk rule in the region (1250-1517 CE) and summarizes histories and descriptions of examples from Egypt with mention of examples in Damascus and Jerusalem.

‘The Earth Mosques of West Africa’ by Nnamdi Elleh covers important academic territory not adequately addressed in contemporary scholarship. The author reviews precedents in other African regions, historical sources and perspectives and outlines the features of the mosque in West Africa, exterior appearance and materials, interior organization, construction and structure and current conservation efforts. Specific examples are illustrated and analyzed from South Africa, Mali, Niger and Nigeria.

‘Coral Stone Mosques in East Africa’ by Vera-Simone Schulz also covers important academic territory in this study of mosques in the region dating back more than a millennium. The author outlines the seaborne connections, Indian Ocean connections and the arrival of the Portuguese. Extant mosques from Kenya and the United Republic of Tanzania are analyzed in terms of material culture and context. The author also studies material artifacts from regional mosques which are now located in European and North American museum collections.

The third section of the volume, Europe includes four essays. ‘Religious Landscape in the Balkans in the Early Ottoman Period’ [noted with a slightly different title in the table of contents] by Jelena Bogdanović outlines a textual and architectural history of this period.
The chapter includes a summary of the conversion of churches into mosques in Constantinople and the Balkans, establishing recognisably Ottoman mosques in Constantinople and the Balkans and discusses churches and synagogues in the Balkans during the 15th and 16th centuries. The chapter is amply illustrated with architectural drawings and photographs of structures from Turkey, Macedonia, Greece and Serbia.

‘The Šerefudin White Mosque’ by Jelena Bogdanović and Vladimir Kulić is a focussed study of the mosque designed by Zlatko Ugljen in Bosnia and Herzegovina in 1979. The chapter outlines the design process, drawing on archival drawings from the architect and photographs of the space. As well, the authors note connections and influences from the region and beyond on the design.

The following two chapters are written by Nebahat Avcioğlu with contextual analysis of architecture and an outstanding critique of contextual scholarship on European mosques, and a focussed study of the first mosque in the United Kingdom. In ‘The Modern and Contemporary Mosque in Europe, Russia and Turkey’, Avcioğlu begins with a critique of scholarship on European modernist architecture and religious architecture. Avcioğlu notes the focus on a select few and the omission of analysis beyond the formal and argues that ‘the modern mosque has never been just about a question of critiquing modernism, for it is also a question of imperialism, postcolonialism, secular republicanism, Islamophobia and identity politics’ (p.254). The author delineates four key chronological architectural phases: the ‘orientalist tradition’; ‘nationalist mosques’; the ‘diasporic mosques’; and the ‘emancipated mosques’. Mosques from United Kingdom, France, Russia, Turkey, Italy, Holland, Ireland and Germany are examined with images throughout. In the following chapter, ‘Britain’s First Mosque: Woking’, Avcioğlu continues with an in-depth analysis of the first purpose-built mosque in England and reviews the historical context, patronage and design. The author also notes the overriding imperialist nature of the mosque, and the relationships between the surface embellishment details at the mosque and historical artifacts in the nearby Oriental University Institute museum.
The **final section** of the volume, the Americas, includes four essays. ‘North American Mosques’ by the late Omar Khalidi, a pioneering scholar of the subject, focuses on the history of mosques in the United States (not ‘North America’): both in converted spaces and purpose built. The chapter covers Islamic identity in relation to architectural expression and focuses on an examination of nine purpose-built mosques throughout the country.

‘Canadian Mosques’ by Tammy Gaber outlines a century of mosque construction in Canada and identified regional patterns in design including pioneering of mosque spaces in the prairies, converted mosques in Quebec, purpose-built mosques in British Columbia, mosque as hubs of community space in the Maritimes, orienting mosques to Mecca in Canada and the extreme north, and the gendering of mosques in Ontario. Throughout the chapter, specific mosques from across the country are analysed with ample images, textual and primary data.

The final two chapters are written by Caroline “Olivia” Wolf and cover mosques in Latin America and an analysis of a mosque in Argentina. In ‘Modern and Contemporary Mosques in Latin America’, Wolf studies the role of mosque spaces in Latin America, often with transnational patronage and impact. The author analyzes mosques in Brazil, Mexico, Venezuela, Columbia, Argentina and Chile. In ‘Argentina’s King Fahd Islamic Cultural Center’, Wolf studies the largest mosque in Latin America, constructed in 1986. Wolf briefly outlines the history of Islam in Argentina, the impetus for construction of the mosque and the spatial qualities.

**Conclusion**

The two-volume set has colour throughout with excellent photography and architectural drawings for some of the buildings. The compendium would have benefited from an introduction in the second volume and a conclusion to wrap up the extent of work surveyed and potential new directions in scholarship. This recast telling of the multi-valent histories of religious architecture of Islam is a visually compelling collection complemented by heterogenous scholarship written clearly; allowing for
experts, students and non-specialists interested in the subject to easily access the content.

Tammy Gaber  
Associate Professor  
Director, McEwen School of Architecture  
Laurentian University  
Ontario, Canada

doi: 10.35632/ajis.v40i1-2.3239
Endnotes


2 The Mosques of Egypt written by Bernard O’Kane – see review essay ‘Timeless or Timely’ in AJISS Volume 34, Issue 3.